Arts Programmes

Toolkit technical report

Louise Mansfield, Neil O'Connell and Howard White

March 2024

Arts interventions for children and young people at-risk of offending or who have offended

YEF Technical Report

Louise Mansfield, Neil O'Connell and Howard White

Plain Language Summary

This technical report summaries findings from a review by Mansfield et al. (2023) of the effect and impact of arts interventions in preventing violence in children and young people at-risk of offending or who have offended. There is no evidence regarding the effects of arts interventions on offending. There is no clear evidence for the effectiveness with respect to behavioural (actions), psychosocial (emotional and cultural), and cognitive (logic/ thought) outcomes.

The review included 43 studies (three quantitative, two mixed-methods and 38 qualitative). The studies spanned the period 2002–2022 and were mostly carried out in the UK and USA.

There is insufficient evidence (too few studies, and which are of poor quality) to support or refute the effectiveness of arts interventions for children and young people at-risk of offending or who have offended for any outcome. However, qualitative evidence suggests that arts interventions may lead to positive emotions, the development of a good sense of self, successful engagement in creative practices, and development of positive personal relationships with peers, family, prison staff and communities for children and young people who are at-risk of offending or who have offended.

Limited evidence suggests that to be effective arts interventions may need to include accessible delivery sites, support from staff, family and community members, expert delivery by professional artists to whom participants could relate, culturally relevant creative activity, a youth focus, consistency, regularity and a sustainable strategy.

There is a need for high quality studies of arts participation for children and young people at risk of offending.

Objective and Approach

This report summarises findings from a review examining the effects of arts interventions on behavioural (actions), psychosocial (emotional and cultural), cognitive (logic/thought) and offending behaviours in children and young people at risk of offending, or who have offended.

This technical report is based on one systematic review by Mansfield et al (2024). The review is a mixed methods systematic review on the effects of arts interventions for children and young people at-risk of offending, or who have offended on behavioural, psychosocial, cognitive and offending outcomes.

The following inclusion and exclusion criteria were used to inform the selection of the review on which to base this technical report.

Inclusion criteria

The review of Mansfield at al. (2024) meets the inclusion criteria for this report, specifically:

- Has as their population children and young people (8–25 years) who were either identified as at-risk of offending behaviour (secondary populations) or already in the criminal justice system (tertiary populations)

- Includes studies of interventions involving arts participation. Arts participation included involvement in artistic and creative activities. Studies which included arts participation as an intervention on its own or alongside other interventions, such as mentoring, were included. They also included studies that used art as therapy (a form of psychotherapy) and as a medium to address emotional difficulties

Exclusion Criteria

Reviews were excluded if they:

- Were not about children and young people at risk or who have offended e.g. Jindal-Snape et al.'s (2018) systematic review of arts participation is for children in general not those at risk of offending.

- Did not assess an arts intervention, or report effects for such interventions; e.g. Kovalenko et al. (2022) is a general review of interventions to reduce youth offending. Some included interventions involve drama but there are no separate effects reports for these interventions.

- Did not have offending is not a primary or secondary outcome, e.g. Jindal-Snape et al.'s systematic review of arts participation assess the effects on academic achievement.

4

Outcomes

- Primary outcomes: offending behaviour and antisocial behaviour
- Secondary outcomes: attendance at arts intervention, education or workplace engagement, psychological/emotional wellbeing, costs, adverse events

Description of Interventions

Arts interventions involved participation in artistic and creative activities. The review by Mansfield et al (2024) included a range of different arts interventions across quantitative and qualitative studies.

The interventions in the studies include music classes, music making and technology, musical composition, listening to and discussing music, Hip Hop Therapy, 'Rap Therapy', recording, and/or performing music, songwriting, lyric writing and video recording, musical composition and computer-based music sequencing, digital music, rapping and spray-painting, Rap Therapy and Hip-Hop Therapy. Painting, sculpture, poetry and writing, drama, theatre and digital arts creation were also included.

The interventions in the quantitative studies were delivered to small groups of 6-12 people or as 1:1 sessions. They were of shorter duration – usually a period of weeks – than interventions in the qualitative studies which ranged from 6 weeks to 5 years.

Logic Model/Theory of Change

Table 1 provides a preliminary logic model, from the systematic review by Mansfield et al., describing the potential chains of causes and effects of arts interventions on preventing offending and anti-social behaviour (primary outcomes), and supporting secondary outcomes including attendance, educational attainment and psychological well-being. It includes consideration of intermediate outcomes associated with the costs of arts interventions and of adverse events. Arts interventions are expected to bring about positive changes in primary and secondary outcomes through a combination of active ingredients including appropriate resources (inputs), planning and intervention design activities and delivery outputs. We consider funding models/imperatives to ensure that attention is paid to how these might impact on whether and how outcomes are successfully achieved and sustained. The logic model has been developed through discussion with the systematic review

5

Advisory Board.[1] It is intended to inform future theory of change approaches to arts interventions for children and young people at-risk of offending or who have offended. The likely theory of change suggests that delivery of well-designed and suitably resourced arts interventions for children and young people in a range of justice settings will foster engagement and improve wellbeing, leading to a reduction in a range of offending and anti-social behaviours.

---

[1] The systematic review team were advised by an Advisory Group convened by the Campbell Collaboration and YEF. The group comprised both academics and practitioners from the UK. The group met three times to guide the scope, research questions, interpretation and presentation of the review.

Table 1: A logic model for arts interventions for at-risk and offending children and young people (8-25 years)

Resources	Planning and intervention	Outputs	Outcomes (to be measured in quantitative studies; qualitative studies to examine processes by which interventions achieve outcomes)	Impacts
Staffing, involvement of professional artists or artist educators and volunteers; supportive youth service staff; financial resources; appropriate facilities including in prisons, communities, youth justice settings; materials and equipment for arts. Appropriately designed activities (including therapeutic, educational, creative, and stand alone, integrated arts) for young people considering age, gender/sex, ethnicity, socioeconomic status, educational experiences, family and community context.	Operational factors in various settings. Programme planning: one-off activities and activities of longer duration; pattern, regularity and consistency of delivery, codesigned programmes, sustainability, cultural relevance Project management, budget, programme planning, venue, facilities and equipment, staffing, training and supervision.	Arts-based activities including instruction, learning and discussion workshops, performances, exhibitions.	**Primary:** • offending behaviour e.g. violence/aggression, weapon carrying/use, any other criminal activity (e.g. theft, drug offences); sexual offences, drug use/misuse; gang involvement; vandalism • anti-social behaviours e.g. aggression, bullying, alcohol use/misuse, problem gambling, delinquency, victimisation/harassment **Secondary/intermediate outcomes** • Participation/attendance with arts interventions • Educational attainment, attendance and engagement (school), exclusions at school • Psychological and emotional wellbeing (e.g. mood, self-esteem, confidence, autonomy, social connections, loneliness, resilience) • Costs and associated economic outcomes, such as a benefit-cost ratio or rate of return. • Adverse events (e.g. negative experiences and emotions associated with arts participation)	Longer term: Enhanced understanding of best practice, increased availability and access to include arts interventions for young people at risk and in contact with criminal justice settings and attention to sustainability of programmes. Wider awareness and understanding leading to policy change and systemic improvements in the justice system, education, social care and health.

7

Evidence Base

Descriptive Overview

In the review by Mansfield et al (2024) there were 54,598 initial records from database searches and 22 from other sources (reference searches and experts' contributions). After de-duplication 20,196 records were retained. 44 records of 43 studies met the eligibility criteria (three quantitative, 38 qualitative and two mixed methods). Five studies (three quantitative and two mixed methods) were included in the quantitative synthesis that included 304 participants. Forty studies (38 qualitative and two mixed methods) were included in the qualitative synthesis that included approximately 620 participants.

Studies were conducted in a range of custodial and non-custodial settings including prison (3 studies) or Young Offender Institutions (4 studies) or detention centre (8 studies), community youth facilities and other community settings (12 studies), education settings (10 studies), an activity camp (1 study), a problem-solving court (1 study) and care settings (3 studies). None of the quantitative studies reported offending behaviour. For the outcome domain 'anti or prosocial behaviour', Anderson (2010) reported the number of behavioural incidents reported in the Young Offenders Institution, Caulfield (2022) measured attitudes and behaviour using the Youth Music Attitudes and Behaviour Scale and Tyson (2002) reported peer relations, using the Index of Peer relations scale.

Two studies (Anderson, 2010; Caulfield, 2022) reported attendance at the arts intervention. Measures of psychological and emotional well-being were reported by four studies (Anderson, 2010; Bittman, 2009; Caulfield, 2022; Tyson, 2002). No studies reported measures of our specified outcomes educational engagement/attainment, workplace engagement, economic outcomes or adverse events. There was no adequate quantitative data to allow for our planned meta-analyses, subgroup or sensitivity analyses, or to draw the pre-planned contrasts between study characteristics described in our plan for narrative synthesis for any evidence.

Effects of Interventions

Arts interventions versus no intervention or usual care

No studies reported results for the outcome 'offending behaviour'.

Anderson (2010) (n= 30) reported the number of behavioural incidents recorded in the Young Offenders Institution. Results were reported for the 14 participants who completed the intervention only (4 in the music group, 5 in the sculpture group and 5 in the control group). During the intervention

0

period, there were 7 incidents in the music group, 6 in the sculpture group and 4 in the control group. In the 3-month post-intervention period there were 3 incidents in the music group, 4 in the sculpture group and 5 in the control group. Data were not reported in a complete enough format to allow computation of effect sizes.

Tyson ([2002](#)) reported effects on peer relations using the 0–100 Index of peer relations (higher scores = worse peer relations). Post-intervention there was no clear evidence for an effect of the arts intervention MD −3.53, 95%CI (1 −8.72 to 1.66). Caulfield ([2022](#)) measured attitude and behaviour using the Youth Music Attitude and Behaviour scale. The study found a significant effect on musical development (d=0.39, p<0.01) and wellbeing (ES=0.32, p<0.05), But no significant effect on attitudes and behaviour (ES=-0.23, p>0.05)

Anderson ([2010](#)) (n = 30) reported attendance for the 14 participants in a Young Offenders Institution in the UK who completed the intervention period. During the project period, 3 men attended 7 classes in the music group, 5 men attended 15 classes in the sculpture group and 5 men attended 12 classes in the control group. In the 3-month period after the formal project intervention finished 3 men attended 12 classes in the music group, 4 men attended 13 classes in the sculpture group and 3 men attended 7 classes in the control group. Data were not reported in adequate detail to allow computation of effect sizes. Caulfield ([2022](#)) (n = 187) measured attendance but did not report specific numeric data to allow the analysis of effect sizes.

Findings on psychological and emotional wellbeing
Self-Esteem. At post-intervention, Anderson ([2010](#)) reported no clear evidence for an effect of a music intervention on self-esteem, measured using the Rosenberg Self-Esteem scale (n for comparison = 9, MD 0.32, 95% CI −0.39 to 1.03) or a sculpture intervention (n for comparison = 10, MD 0.50, 95% CI −0.21 to 1.21).

Locus of control. At post-intervention, Anderson ([2010](#)) reported no clear evidence for an effect of a music intervention on locus of control, measured using the locus of control behaviour scale (n for comparison = 9, MD −0.26, 95% CI −1.37 to 0.85) or a sculpture intervention (n for comparison = 10, MD −0.16, 95% CI −1.05 to 0.73).

Self-concept. Tyson (2002) reported no clear evidence for an effect of Hip Hop Therapy post-intervention on self-concept, measured using the self-concept scale for children (n for comparison = 11, MD 2.73, 95% CI −6.29 to 11.75, Analysis 1.2).

Arts interventions versus other types of intervention
The only outcome where there was evidence comparing one arts intervention to another was psychological and emotional well-being. Anderson (2010) (n = 30) compared a group receiving a music-based arts intervention with a group receiving a sculpture-based intervention. They reported results for this comparison based on 9 participants who completed the interventions. Post-intervention there was no clear evidence for an effect on self-esteem (MD −0.18, 95% CI −0.76 to 0.4) or locus of control (MD −0.10, 95% CI −1.01 to 0.81).

Arts interventions versus non-arts intervention
Only one study compared an arts intervention to a non-arts intervention. DeCarlo (2004) compared participant preferences for RAP therapy or group psycho- educational therapy to support prosocial development outcomes. In general, participants expressed a preference for music therapy. However, data were not reported in adequate detail to allow the analysis of effect sizes.

Implementation experience
The qualitative evidence in the Mansfield et al (2024) review synthesized micro, meso and macro level processes associated with taking part in arts interventions which impacted on behavioural, psycho-social, cognitive and offending outcomes for at-risk and offending children and young people. Such processes help to explain potential barriers and facilitators associated with delivering arts interventions for at risk and offending children and young people.

Micro-level experiences barriers and facilitators
Micro-level processes identify the relationships between children and young people at-risk of offending or who have already offended, arts interventions, individual demographics, cultures, sociopsychological and cognitive factors.

The qualitative studies all reported that participants experienced a range of positive emotions through taking part in arts-based interventions. Some specific emotions were identified including feelings of hope and aspiration (Atherton, 2022), enjoyment (Gowland-Pryde, 2016), self-confidence or courage (Barrett, 2015; Caulfield, 2019; Gann, 2010; Lotter, 2015), pride in successfully creating an art form or

2

gratitude at having access to art-based interventions (Daykin, 2017; Hadland, 2010; Seroczynski, 2011), and being valued, respected and/or praised for their involvement and creative outcomes (Bowey, 2006; Caulfield, 2022: Chong, 2020; Lazzari, 2005; Nicklin, 2017; Parker, 2018; Thompson, 2015, 2022). Positive emotional experiences of arts-based interventions generally underpinned and served to foster a sense of possibility or hope for the future, including able to manage and change more negative emotions and traumatic experiences associated with being at risk, having offended and/or being in the justice system (Caulfield, 2019; Fullchange, 2018; Hanrahan, 2017; Pope, 2022; Varley, 2019; Winn, 2010, 2011).

Positive emotional experiences were also reported as encouraging development of a more positive attitude to learning, employment and skill development (Cesar, 2020; Tett, 2012) and acceptance of the potential benefits of creative activity (Caulfield, 2019). The elicitation of positive emotions was reported as enhancing self-reflection and a critical self-awareness for CYP defined as at-risk or offending. Participants were reported as being able to redefine a more (self) caring and accepting sense of identity that challenged and resisted established and negative mindsets through learning new skills and achieving successful arts-related outcomes (Atherton, 2022; Clennon, 2015; Gann, 2010; Hanrahan, 2017; Massó-Guijarro, 2020; Morgan, 2020; Nicklin, 2017; Parker, 2018; Tett, 2012; Thompson, 2015; Winn, 2010, 2011). It was suggested by study authors that such processes of self-determination could enable experiences of autonomy and empowerment through participation in art activities (Hickey, 2018; Lotter, 2015; Pope, 2022). The creative process itself was cited as important in allowing for experiences of self-expression and sometimes through the perception that participation in the arts allows for exploration through risk in a safe context (Atherton, 2022; Baker, 2007; Barrett, 2012; Cesar, 2020; de Roeper, 2009; Gowland-Pryde, 2016; Hickey, 2018; Lazzari, 2005; Lotter, 2015; Podkalicka, 2009; Varley, 2019).

Arts-based interventions for children and young people at-risk of offending or who have offended, contributed to the development of positive personal relationships with other children, young people and adults involved in the arts intervention work. Arts-based interventions were reported to allow for supportive interactions that could lead to relationships of trust, reciprocity and care (Atherton, 2022; Caulfield, 2019; Cesar, 2020; Daykin, 2017; Hanrahan, 2017; Lazzari, 2005; Lea, 2019; Massó-Guijarro, 2020; Morgan, 2020; Nicklin, 2017; Parker, 2018; Zlotowitz, 2016). Arts interventions were also described as fostering more collaborative relationships based on sharing and/or listening, features that can support help-seeking behaviours. Arts-based interventions for children and young people in this population groups were reported as helping participants to develop a sense of belonging and

3

positive awareness of others including those in the justice setting and more broadly with families and communities.

Micro-level barriers to the successful implementation of arts interventions for children and young people at-risk of offending or who have offended were identified to some extent. Where participants felt that they had no choice about participation or the arts activities and where arts interventions were not culturally relevant to them, implementation was challenging (Howard, 2022). Achieving positive outcomes from arts interventions was made difficult in situations where there were high levels of anxiety amongst participants generally (Flores, 2016) and where anxiety levels could be exacerbated in the context of having to learn something or perform (Fullchange, 2018; Hickey, 2018) There is also recognition that positive personal experiences happen only in the moment of taking part in arts and may not necessarily spill over into wider life (Cesar, 2020).

Meso-level processes influencing design and delivery
Meso-level processes identify community-level experiences and impacts as well as design and implementation influences of arts interventions for children and young people at-risk of offending or who have offended. In the qualitative studies meso level findings also capture connections between micro and meso-level processes and reflect contextual (residential/setting status and involvement, family and community support), intervention (providers, type, youth-focused, facilities and theoretical framing) and implementation (mode delivery, fidelity, adherence, local support structures) domains.

Qualitative studies identified the significance of understanding the setting in which arts interventions were taking place for successful engagement and delivery and provided evidence of the contextual complexity of arts intervention work. Studies reported that successful arts interventions in prison settings were designed to recognise but disrupt or distract from the punitive/penal structures (Atherton, 2022; Baker, 2007; Hickey, 2018; Lazzari, 2005). Arts-based interventions were also reported as offering a more flexible environment than that of formal education, allowing participants to be creative, learn, achieve and interact with others in positive, relatively informal ways. The suggestion that this led to supportive and trusting relationships was made for interventions both in custodial, community (Caulfield, 2022; Morgan, 2020; Podkalicka, 2009) and educational settings (Jordan, 2015; Parker, 2018). Studies identified further contextual complexity in terms of the importance of ensuring that arts-based interventions included culturally relevant programmes. Culturally relevant features included art activities that reflected the interests and needs of children and young people at-risk of offending and were meaningful to them such as music technology

4

(Clennon, 2015), writing, poetry and music (Lea, 2019), songwriting, lyric writing and video recording (Massó-Guijarro, 2020), rap music composition (Baker, 2007; Hickey, 2018) and music making (Thompson, 2015). Studies also reported elements of implementation complexity as important in ensuring arts-based interventions elicited positive emotional and behavioural outcomes including enabling creativity as self-expression and/or risk-taking in a non-judgemental (safe) environment (Atherton, 2022; Baker, 2007; Barrett, 2012; Cesar, 2020; de Roeper, 2009; Gowland-Pryde, 2016; Hickey, 2018; Lotter, 2015; Podkalicka, 2009; Varley, 2019) and ensuring participants felt a sense of ownership and belonging in the arts intervention space (Bowey, 2006; Clennon, 2015; de Roeper, 2009; Pope, 2022). Intervention complexity was reported in studies including the importance of facilitator characteristics, attitudes and behaviours, expert arts instructions, leadership or facilitation, by a relatable and/or experienced 'artist' who was able to work the CYPs to co-produce art, take a position that respectfully challenging young people to be creative and supported them in their endeavours to engage in the process of producing art (Atherton, 2022; Caulfield, 2019; Clennon, 2015; Daykin, 2017; Gowland-Pryde, 2016; Howard, 2022; Lazzari, 2005; Pope, 2022; Tett, 2012). Additionally, complexity in barriers to design and implementation were reported to include negative attitudes of prison staff to arts interventions (Daykin, 2017; Howard, 2022).

Macro-level influences on experiences, barriers and facilitators

Macro-level processes refer to findings reported about wider societal, economic and political drivers and impacts of arts interventions. Macro-level findings capture the interconnections between societal contexts in which arts interventions are designed and implemented and local experience of participants. Studies did not always refer directly to macro-level processes in reports of findings, but there was some, albeit limited commentary on the ways in which these shaped complexity in terms of experiences of children and young people at-risk of offending or who had offended, the design and delivery of arts intervention, and their potential to impact on behavioural, psycho- social, cognitive and offending outcomes. We note here that the evidence for macro level process was extremely limited and restricted to four studies. Therefore, clear conclusions about them are not possible. One qualitative study from the USA reported the arts intervention as a response to a lack of policy advocacy for the arts for children and young people at risk of offending or who had offended and associated limits to funding streams which impact negatively on prioritising of arts programmes in the sector (Cesar, 2020). One study highlighted the need to develop interventions with external partners in policy and practice to implement sustainable and successful arts programmes for offending children and young people connected to the justice system (Caulfield, 2019). One study from South Korea (Chong, 2020) and another from the USA (Winn, 2010) identified the need to connect arts-based interventions

5

to wider communities and national organisations for supporting children and young people at-risk of offending. The study implied that partnership working between the justice system, and education, housing and healthcare organisations could serve to support more effective and sustainable design and delivery of arts programmes to address potential and actual offending behaviours.

Cost evidence

No cost evidence was found in the review.

Quality assessment

Assessment of Quality of the included review

The review of Mansfield et al. (2024) is deemed to be of high quality.

The review is rated Yes on all eight items of the modified AMSTAR tool used for the assessment (see Annex 1). The inclusion criteria capture all elements of the PICOS. A comprehensive search was used, as were double screening and coding. The authors give a descriptive overview of included studies, and use separate risk of bias tools for quantitative and qualitative studies. Heterogeneity analysis was planned but could not be conducted as the authors could not conduct a meta-analysis as effect sizes could not be calculated for the quantitative studies. There is a statement of conflict of interest and sources of funding. In addition, the protocol was published online in Campbell Systematic Reviews (Mansfield et al., 2023).

Assessment of Quality of the Evidence included in the Review

Quantitative studies were small, conducted in a single centre, and at high risk of bias across multiple domains. Using Cochrane Risk of Bias assessment, only two studies were described as randomised and, of those, only one described that process adequately. No study reported a process of allocation concealment. While blinding is clearly challenging in this field there was little detail reported on attrition or appropriate methods of analysis to account for it. No study was pre- registered with an available protocol, and so there is a risk of selective outcome reporting and other post hoc changes in study conduct. The reported details of interventions was often quite superficial, creating challenges for understanding what was done, and subsequently for replication. The use of GRADE resulted in the finding that insufficient evidence from quantitative studies to support or refute the effectiveness of arts interventions for children and young people at-risk of offending or who have offended for any outcome.

6

Methodological weaknesses were found in most qualitative studies including limited discussion of recruitment strategies, scant detail about data collection, a lack of rigour in data analysis, no adequate discussion of relationships between participants and researcher, and a lack of information regarding ethical procedures, approvals or issues. The use of the CERQual schema for judging the confidence in the findings from the synthesis of qualitative evidence results in a judgement of very low confidence about the evidence for under- standing micro, meso, and macro-level processes influencing the successful design and delivery of arts-based interventions for at-risk and offending young people and their impact on behavioural, psychological, cognitive and offending outcomes. Very low confidence judgements are due to major concerns with methodological limitations, coherence and adequacy, and moderate concerns about relevance.

Impact

No overall impact rating is provided in this technical report on grounds of 'insufficient evidence'. The evidence base is small and of low quality. For the majority of included studies and comparisons of interest the necessary data to calculate an effect size were not reported. For all comparisons and all outcomes it was not possible to pool data from more than one study, and all observed effects were rated as very low certainty due to study limitations and imprecision.

Findings from UK/Ireland

Annex 2 summarizes the characteristics of three included quantitative studies conducted in the UK (Anderson, 2010; Bittman, 2009; Caulfield, 2022). Annex 3 summarises the characteristics of sixteen included qualitative studies which were conducted in the UK (Anderson, 2010; Atherton, 2022; Bowey, 2006; Caulfield, 2019; 2022; Clennon, 2015; Daykin, 2017; Gowland-Pryde, 2016; Hadland, 2010; Hanrahan, 2017; Howard, 2022; Morgan, 2020; Parker, 2018; Tett, 2012; Varley, 2019; Zlotowitz, 2016). Summary characteristics reflect approach to data extraction for quantitative or qualitative studies as published in the protocol for the review and extracted data informed either the quantitative synthesis about effects of interventions or qualitative synthesis about implementation experience.

What don't we know?

There are few studies of the effects of arts participation for children and young people at risk of offending, and these studies have methodological weaknesses. Therefore we cannot make a conclusion of the effects of these interventions, with the need being for high quality studies of impact.

Summary

We found insufficient evidence from quantitative studies to support or refute the effectiveness of arts interventions for children and young people at-risk of offending or who have offended for any outcome. We report very low confidence about the evidence for understanding the processes influencing the successful design and delivery of arts interventions in this population of children and young people and their impact on behavioural, psychosocial, cognitive and offending behaviours.

References for Included Studies

Anderson Kirstin, Overy Katie. Engaging Scottish Young Offenders in Education through Music and Art. International Journal of Community Music. 2010;3(1):47–64.

Atherton Susie, Knight Victoria, van Barthold Benedict Carpenter. Penal Arts Interventions and Hope: Outcomes of Arts-Based Projects in Prisons and Community Settings. The Prison journal (Philadelphia, Pa). 2022;102(2):217–36.

Baker Sarah, Homan Shane. Rap, Recidivism and the Creative Self: A Popular Music Programme for Young Offenders in Detention. Journal of youth studies. 2007;10(4):459–76.

Barrett Margaret S, Baker Jane S. Developing learning identities in and through music: A case study of the outcomes of a music programme in an Australian juvenile detention centre. International Journal of Music Education. 2012;30(3):244–59.

Barrett Margaret S, Bond Nigel. Connecting through music: The contribution of a music programme to fostering positive youth development. Research Studies in Music Education. 2015;37(1):37–54.

Bittman Barry, Dickson Larry, Coddington Kim. Creative musical expression as a catalyst for quality-of-life improvement in inner-city adolescents placed in a court-referred residential treatment program. Adv Mind Body Med. 2009;24(1):8–19.

Bowey Laura, McGlaughlin Alex. The Youth Crime Reduction Video Project: An Evaluation of a Pilot Intervention Targeting Young People at Risk of Crime and School Exclusion. Howard Journal of Criminal Justice. 2006;45(3):268–83.

Caulfield, L., Sojka, B., & Massie, R. An evaluation of Sandwell Youth Offending Service–a creative approach to working with young people. Sandwell YOS - a creative approach to working with young people. Sandwell YOS - a creative approach to working with young people by University of Wolverhampton - 2019

Caulfield L, Jolly A, Simpson E, Devi-McGleish Y. "It's Not Just Music, It Helps You from Inside": Mixing Methods to Understand the Impact of Music on Young People in Contact With the Criminal Justice System. Youth Justice-An International Journal. 2022;22(1):67–84.

Cesar Gabriel T, Decker Scott H. "CPS sucks, but… I think I'm better off in the system:" Family, social support, & arts-based mentorship in child protective services. Child Youth Serv Rev. 2020;118:1–13.

Chong Hyun Ju, Yun Juri. Music therapy for delinquency involved juveniles through tripartite collaboration: A mixed method study. Front Psychol. 2020;11:589431.

Clennon. 'Holdin' on': using music technology as a tool of cultural liberation with respect to performing masculinities at a young offenders' institution. In: Liberation Practices. Routledge; 2015. p. 71–83.

Daykin Norma, de Viggiani Nick, Moriarty Yvonne, Pilkington Paul. Music-making for health and wellbeing in youth justice settings: Mediated affordances and the impact of context and social relations. SociolHealth Illn. 2017;39(6):941–58.

DeCarlo A, Hockman E. RAP therapy: a group work intervention method for urban adolescents. Soc Work Groups. 2004;26(3):45–59.

de Roeper Julia, Savelsberg Harry J. Challenging the youth policy imperative: engaging young people through the arts. Journal of youth studies. 2009;12(2):209–25.

Flores K, van Niekerk C, le Roux L. Drumming as a medium to promote emotional and social functioning of children in middle childhood in residential care. Music Education Research. 2016;18(3):254–68.

Fullchange Aileen, Sharkey Jill D. Experience and outcomes of a theatre intervention for youth on probation and their university peers. Appl Psychol Crim Justice. 2018;14(1):70–85.

Gann Elliot. The effects of Therapeutic Hip Hop activity groups on perception of self and social supports in at-risk urban adolescents. PhD Dissertation. 2010;71(5):3355.

Gowland-Pryde Ronda. Leaping forward: from "young offenders" to "young artists." PhD Dissertation. 2017

Hadland Rachel, Stickley Theodore. Community art project for excluded teenagers. Mental Health Practice. 2010;13(6):18–23.

Hanrahan Fidelma, Banerjee Robin. 'It makes me feel alive': The socio-motivational impact of drama and theatre on marginalised young people. Emot Behav Diffic. 2017;22(1):35–49.

Hickey Maud. 'We all come together to learn about music'1: A qualitative analysis of a 5-year music program in a juvenile detention facility. International Journal of Offender Therapy and Comparative Criminology. 2018;62(13):4046–66.

Howard F. Using and Abusing the Arts with 'At-Risk' Youth. Journal of Applied Youth Studies. 2022;5(2):101–16.

Howard, F. Artistic production and (re) production: dis-engaged young people's educational experiences of Arts Award programmes. https://eprints.nottingham.ac.uk/55708/ PhD Dissertation. 2019;1:1–200.

Jordan Carol, Daday Jerry. Theatre-in-Diversion: Evaluating an Arts-Based Approach to Combating Juvenile Delinquency. Theatre Symposium. 2015;23:81–138.

Lazzari MM, Amundson KA, Jackson RL. "We are more than jailbirds": An arts program for incarcerated young women. Affilia-Journal of Women And Social Work. 2005;20(2):169–85

Lea CH, Malorni A, Jones TM. "Everybody is an Artist": Arts-based Education and Formerly Incarcerated Young Black Men's Academic and Social–Emotional Development in an Alternative School. AmJCommunity Psychol. 2019;64(3–4):333–47.

Lotter Carol Barbara. Circles of Courage : music therapy with adolescents in conflict with the law at a community based setting. PhD Dissertation. 2015;1:1–450

Massó-Guijarro B, Montes-Rodríguez R. Educational and social uses of music and video creation for a group of young offenders. International Journal of Interdisciplinary Cultural Studies. 2020;16(1):1–14.

Morgan Haydn, Parker Andrew, Marturano Naomi. Community-Based Intervention and Marginalised Youth: Inclusion, Social Mobility and Life-Course Transition. Journal of Education and Work. 2020;33(5–6):327–42.

Nicklin Laura Louise. 'Make Not Your Prisons Your Prisons': Participant-perceived Potential Outcomes of a Shakespeare Focussed Alternative to Juvenile Incarceration in the USA. Emotional Behav Difficulties. 2017;22(1):2–17.

Parker A, Marturano N, O'Connor G, Meek R. Marginalised youth, criminal justice and performing arts: young people's experiences of music-making. Journal of Youth Studies. 2018;21(8):1061–76.

Podkalicka A. Young listening: An ethnography of YouthWorx Media's radio project. Continuum-Journal of Media and Cultural Studies. 2009;23(4):561–72.

Pope RJ, Jones JN. Creative and Expressive Arts in a Young Adult Problem-Solving Court and Its Influence on Participant Experience and Outcomes. Youth & Society. 2022;54(7):1225–46.

Ruggiero Dana, de Hurtado Belen Garcia, Watson William R. Juvenile offenders: Developing motivation, engagement, and meaning-making through video game creation. International Journal of Game-Based Learning. 2013;3(2):112–29.

Seroczynski AD, Johnson Scott P, Lamb Kristen, Gustman Brian. The hidden virtues of Harry Potter: Using J K Rowling's novels to facilitate character education with juvenile delinquents. Journal of Research in Character Education. 2011;9(1):1–24.

Tett L, Anderson K, Mcneill F, Overy K, Sparks R. Learning, rehabilitation and the arts in prisons: a Scottish case study. Studies in the Education of Adults. 2012;44(2):171–85.

11

Tyson Edgar H. Hip Hop Therapy: An Exploratory Study of a Rap Music Intervention with At-Risk and Delinquent Youth. Journal of poetry therapy. 2002;15(3):131.

Thompson JD. Towards cultural responsiveness in music instruction with black detained youth: an analytic autoethnography. Music Education Research. 2015;17(4):421–36.

Thompson Bethany Uhler. Beyond the Corner: Introducing a String Music Program to Youth in Detention. String Research Journal. 2022;12(1):61–83.

Varley Daniela Stasia. Acting Around in Young Offender Rehabilitation : Investigating How Psychological Theory Fused with Drama Techniques Can Create a Model (The V^2 Model) for Reducing Crime when Working with Young Offenders Within the Community. PhD Dissertation. 2019

Winn MT. "Our side of the story": moving incarcerated youth voices from margins to center. Race Ethnicity and Education. 2010;13(3):313–25.

Winn Maisha T, Jackson Chelsea A. Toward a performance of possibilities: Resisting gendered (in)justice. Int J Qual Stud Educ. 2011;24(5):615–20.

Zlotowitz Sally, Barker Chris, Moloney Olive, Howard Charlotte. Service users as the key to service change? The development of an innovative intervention for excluded young people. Child Adolesc Ment Health. 2016;21(2):102–8.

Additional References

Jindal-Snape, D. Davies, D. Scott, R., Robb, A., Murray, C. Harkins, C. (2018) Impact of arts participation on children's achievement: A systematic literature review, *Thinking Skills and Creativity*, 29, 59-70,
ISSN 1871-1871, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tsc.2018.06.003

Kovalenko, A. G., Abraham, C., Graham-Rowe, E., Levine, M., & O'Dwyer, S. (2022). What Works in Violence Prevention Among Young People?: A Systematic Review of Reviews. Trauma, Violence, & Abuse, 23(5), 1388-1404. https://doi.org/10.1177/1524838020939130

Mansfield, L., Daykin, N., O'Connell, N. E., Bailey, D., Forde, L., Smith, R., & Gifford, J. (2023). PROTOCOL: A mixed methods systematic review on the effects of arts interventions for at-risk and offending children and young people on behavioural, psychosocial, cognitive and offending outcomes. Campbell Systematic Reviews, 19, e1298. https://doi.org/10.1002/cl2.1298

Mansfield, L., Daykin, N., O'Connell, N. E., Bailey, D., Forde, L., Smith, R., Gifford, J., & Ashdown-Franks, G. (2024). A mixed methods systematic review on the effects of arts interventions for children and young people at-risk of offending, or who have offended on behavioural, psychosocial, cognitive and offending outcomes: A systematic review. Campbell Systematic Reviews, 20, e1377. https://doi.org/10.1002/cl2.1377

Annex 1 Assessment of included review

1.	Did the research questions and inclusion criteria for the review include the components of the PICOS?	Yes (Section 4.1)
2.	Did the review authors use a comprehensive literature search strategy? At least two bibliographic databases should be searched (partial yes) plus at least one of website searches or snowballing (yes).	Yes. Over 12 databases searched, selected websites and snowballing.
3.	Did the review authors perform study selection in duplicate?	Yes
4.	Did the review authors perform data extraction in duplicate?	Yes
5.	Did the review authors describe the included studies in adequate detail?	Yes. Descriptive overview of studies (section 5.1)
6.	Did the review authors use a satisfactory technique for assessing the risk of bias (RoB) in individual studies that were included in the review?	Yes. Cochrane RoB for quantitative and CASP qualitative tool for qualitative studies.
7.	Did the review authors provide a satisfactory explanation for discussion of, any heterogeneity observed in the results of the review?	Yes. Planned but not conducted as inadequate data.
8.	Did the review authors report any potential sources of conflict of interest, including any funding they received for conducting the review?	Yes. Funding declared and no conflict identified.

14

Annex 2: Summary Characteristics of Included Studies Review (Quantitative)

Study ID	Study objectives	Design	Country	Setting	Participant Description/ N	Intervention Description (all RCT Study Design)	Comparison group details/ N	Outcomes
Anderson and Overy 2010, UK	examined music and art classes as a way to engage young offenders in education	Non randomised controlled trial	UK	Young offenders institution (YOI)	Young males in YOI N=30 (14 completers)	Music classes N=4 Art classes (sculpture) 8 weeks. N=5	Educational control. Usual practice. Classes in Numeracy & Maths or Communication & Literacy N=5	Behaviour incidents Engagement with education Self Esteem Locus of control Emotion
Bittman 2009, UK	evaluate the effectiveness of a novel creative musical expression protoco for inner-city youth in a court-referred residential treatment program	Randomised cross-over study	USA	Bethesda childrens home. Secure residential treatment facility	Adolescent and teen residents. N=52 30 F, 20 M	Recreational Music Making 6 weeks, x1 weekly	Usual practice	Level of functioning Psychopathology Anger Depression
Caulfield et al 2022, UK	evaluate a music programme for young offenders	Non randomised comparative study	UK	Young offenders service	Young offenders. participants were referred by their YOT caseworker. N=42 3 F, 39 M	Music programme incl. production skills and composition to performance skills and music tuition 12 weeks, x1 weekly	Cohort of children who did not attend programme. N=145	Attitude and behaviour Wellbeing Attendance

Annex 3: Summary Characteristics of Included Studies (Qualitative)

Author surnames (date, location of study)	Study objectives	Qualitative approach qualitative methods	Description of study including activities and participants	Details of qualitative analysis (What analysis techniques are used on what data?)	For qualitative themes, describe mechanisms and processes by which intervention is delivered and experienced.	Study conclusions
Anderson & Overy (2010, Scotland, UK)	To examine music and art classes as a way to engage young offenders in education, and to see if such engagement had an effect on their further participation in education, self-esteem, self-control, behaviour and literacy skill	Structured interviews 13 participants post intervention	8-week intervention. Once a week session at the Juvenile centre, 2.5-3.5 hours long. Aim of the sessions was to engage the men in creating music and art within a group setting – combination of individual and group practice.

3 groups:
Group 1: Music sessions-
Group 2: Art
Group 3 Control (education classes) | Not reported | Participants' expectations and opinions of sessions: Music group participants reported the sessions as being 'different' and 'more worthwhile than other sessions taken. Thought teachers and people made it good.

Participants' feelings of belonging to the group: All the men in the art and music sessions reported feeling 'like part of the group' because they knew someone in the group already, playing | This project demonstrated that arts programmes can offer offenders a creative learning and social environment that can help them better engage with education and enjoy learning. |

			14 young males from HM YOI Polmont in Scotland. Aged between 17–21 years old. Never participated in art/music before.		and recording the instruments in a group Reasons why participants may or may not recommend the music and art session to other men in prison: nine men who participated in the music and art sessions said they would recommend. men highlighted two reasons for wanting something meaningful to do: (1) meaningful, engaging work makes serving time more manageable and (2) Can show they have the commitment to work.	
Atherton et al. (2022, UK)	To explore how innovative arts interventions can be deployed with enhanced wellbeing benefits and can, therefore, be adopted and	Qualitative - Inspired by social action methodology Distinctive semi-structured interview	Soft Touch Arts based workshops called *Unlocked* in prison and community settings.	All interviews were digitally recorded, stored and transcribed. Thematic analysis was then used by	**Instilling Hope** The programme design emphasised choice and options for inmates to engage in accordance	Successful arts projects disrupt penal structures that limit and sedate those within the system. They do this by reducing social

	recognized as meaningful rehabilitation initiatives.	schedules were designed to explore arts practice and wellbeing. Interviews of art students were supplemented by five key staff and other project-related stakeholder interviews; the researchers also attended meetings and two exhibitions.	The workshops adopt social prescribing. Lead artists facilitate the participants to shape their own learning and create their own meaningful artworks. The program followed the principles of Leamy et al.'s (2011) CHIME framework In the prison setting, weekly sessions dovetailed with another project which focused on music production. Purposeful and opportunistic sampling. 16 arts students (10 men in the prison and 6 men and women in the community)	incorporating the CHIME model (Leamy et al., 2011). The framework includes five recovery themes: (C) Connectedness, (H) Hope and optimism about the future, (I) Identity, (M) Meaning in life, and (E) Empowerment. The study focuses on one particular theme, hope.	with their own preferences and abilities. Programme design was sensitive to the prison environment, which demands flexible delivery. Workshop leaders offered facilitation, sign-posting and encouragement as opposed to seeking control and making demands for engagement. Crucially, the reference to inmates as artists allowed them to start to change their identity in addition to learning new skills. As a critical stage in the desistance journey, this shift was important in encouraging participation and moving away from the more oppressive controls experienced day-to-day	isolation, valuing people as artists and contributing to a sense of purpose. The environment of social interaction and teamwork fosters trust, creativity, learning from each other and experiencing supportive relationships. This is the mechanism that enables participants to cope with the regime of prison or the demands of probation and empowers them to make choices, try new things, experience hope and imagine different futures. , and cope with the findings demonstrate that the ethos, delivery, and focus on creativity are key components in

					(Cheliotis & Jordanoska, 2016; Walsh, 2018). In addition, the social contact with others in a setting geared towards learning, interaction, and generating hope was also important (Huxley, 1997) in encourage innovation. The creativity was cited as important, as was the sense of purpose and meaning these activities had to them (Hacking et al., 2008). **Hope as self care** All respondents in both prison and community settings noted the value of arts practice as a mechanism for self-care or coping with the penal experience. This is done via the programme ethos that values social interaction in a creative	achieving the aims of Unlocked, alongside the creation of a relationship of trust and reciprocity. Hope and self-worth were the key emotions and responses drawn from those engaged in activities in which the focus was on themselves, their skills, and the use of time as a means of coping with time outside the arts workshops. The therapeutic element of hope was clearly important (Begley & Blackwood, 2000) in counteracting overwhelming emotions and feelings of depression, anxiety, and hopelessness about the future. Hope was

					space and through personalized support from facilitators. These features allowed participants to experience a sense of relaxation, social interaction, relief from boredom, spiritual awareness and the chance to develop personal artistic practices.	also identified as an important mechanism for change.
					Hope as aspiration All of the respondents made a connection to their own wellbeing, particularly experiencing an increase in confidence and an ability to focus on the future - a significant indicator of 'goal-setting behaviour'. Key processes for participants include realise goals by targeting skills and overcoming fears, including fears of	

					others' judgement, and imagining possibilities in which they might achieve success e.g. in employment and have a positive impact,. The project also helped participants in their plan for resettlement. Journeying though the creative process also disrupted negative patterns of self-identity. **Hope as a mechanism for change** The programme fostered a continued engagement and interaction, based on a recognition of the need for participants to be reintegrated into the community on their release and the need to mitigate risks of returning to their old life before prison. The	

| | | | | | presence of the project in the community meant that participants, particularly those on probation, could continue to utilise its mechanisms for change.

Extending Hope - Transference
The presence of the project in the community allowed those on probation to access a creative outlet that mitigated against the challenges clients faced in reintegrating into the community. This helped to sustain their changing self-identity and their sense of hope and belonging. | |
| Bowey and McGlaughln (2006, UK) | To evaluate the Youth Crime Reduction Video Project and identify the extent to which the project had been | Individual interviews with N=11 young people within one | Video pilot intervention feasibility study in Nottingham, UK | Not reported | Programme was a positive experience overall for | Successful intervention with at-risk youth requires a long-term systematic approach to |

	successful and inform future development of the project.	week of the intervention.	Aimed to improve attitudes to crime and the police, to reduce exclusion, and to develop self-esteem in young people at risk of offending and/or school exclusion. The intervention was run over six days, four days at the National Centre for Citizenship and the Law Justice in Nottingham) and two days being an outward-bound weekend. The project focused mainly on issues around crime, and resulted in each group producing a video.		participants. Success mechanisms included Appreciation of being treated as adults Learning teambuilding skills, acting skills, and relational skills Increased confidence Sense of achievement Learning ways to get along with people with whom previously had difficulty relationship with Raising awareness of issues related to crime and encouraged them to think about the consequences of involvement in crime: More positive feelings towards the police by building relationships with officers through programme Issues with having past negative experiences	target all areas of young people's lives. Aspects of the project may prove useful as part of a broader early intervention programme

					with police officers involved in project included Lack of youth ownership over project Lack of structure and boredom	
		18 YP recruited and commenced the intervention. Full data sets for 11 YP recruited from 2 schools who were asked to select ten year nine pupils who met the criteria of being excluded or at risk of being excluded, and/or having offended or showing the potential for offending.				
Caulfield (2019, UK)	To conduct a process and impact evaluation of Sandwell's creative approach to addressing youth offending and explore if and how impacts occur. The evaluation focus is on understanding engagement of young people, motivation and aspirations and openness/confidence for staff to use arts-based	Process evaluation Semi-structured interviews with 8 young people data on gender and ethnicity for monitoring data and programme overall but not for	Multiple arts interventions taken up by young people as choice including drawing, photography, pottery, nail art, up cycling graffiti (for carers), media project, music programme and	Thematic Analysis but no detail	Facilitation engagement of YP (practicalities, person centred breaking down barriers) Staff involvement (engagement, workloads, sustainability, internal communication) External partnerships (development)	New creative approach with arts is showing success on outcomes. Continue to Evaluate Codesign programme with young people Advocate for value of arts in youth justice

	interventions. Examines changing relationships (e.g. family, peers), attitudes, behaviours and wellbeing of YPs, and relationship between impact and process and barriers.	interviewees in the study	bespoke activities e.g. quilt making, spoken word and painting.		Personal impact (confidence, wellbeing, attitude to cerative activity) Skill development (creative and communications) Better relationships (staff and peers) New opportunities and aspirations (aspirations and plans for future)	Build internal and external partnerships in youth justice and the arts
Caulfield et al. (2022, UK)	To provide robust measurement of impact and also elicit an understanding of the mechanisms by which change occurs in a music programme run by a Youth Offending team (YOT)	Mixed methods. Qualitative element. Semi-structured interviews with N=23 participants.	Young offenders referred by their caseworker N=2 female, N=21 male Age range 13-20 years	Music programme Aims, to develop the creative, expressive and musical ability of children and young people; improve children and young people's confidence and well-being; and improve the level of compliance and successful completion of court orders among project participants.	5 themes: confidence, professional and social skills; achievements, engagement, and aspirations; wellbeing; and relationships with staff Confidence, professional and social skills. Developments in their confidence, social, and communication skills as a direct result of taking part in the programme. These participants were	The music programme fulfils the aims of developing the creative, expressive and musical ability of children and young people; improving children and young people's confidence and wellbeing.

| | | | | One to one session with music leader. x1, 2-hour session/ week for 12 weeks | able to link increases in confidence and improved communication skills to areas of their life beyond the music programme. Achievements, engagement aspirations Coming to recognise their own achievements and personal developments through the programme. Becoming motivated and engaged through participation Well-being Feeling calmer and more positive during music sessions. The positive regulation of emotions was expressed. Relationships with staff. All the children were positive about the support and approach of project staff. Children spoke about the respectful relationships | |

				developed with the programme staff. Of note is that the children spoke about not only the support, but the importance of constructive critical feedback from the programme team.	
Clennon (2015, UK)	To explore identity and culture and what it means to be both a producer and consumer of culture, and connections between young people's culture and systems of low aspiration and underachievement	Performance ethnography informed by liberation psychology in which processes of writing, performing and recording MC (rap) tracks were used as participatory tools to gather qualitative data around the participants' views about their identities and popular culture.	A 20-week music technology project: delivered between 2006 and 2007 by a multidisciplinary staff team of artists, researchers and a prison education officer, who integrated the work with the institution's education programme. Participants were 15 young men, aged between 16 and 18, working in groups of eight. A core group of seven participants	Thematic analysis of lyric sketches and session notes.	Participants went through a process of 'conscientization', from resistance, reflected in themes of 'what does being a man mean, dialogue, lyrics, being tough, jailhouse, maintaining your distance, to liberation, reflected in themes of 'nigger' and slavery, recovering historical memory, importance of family and defetishisation, involved a shift from notions of 'being tough', and 'maintaining distance' towards ideas about	The creative process encouraged personal reform with aspects of improving wellbeing and conscientization.

			engaged over 20 weeks. Participants undertook creative writing, mind mapping and team-based music technology activities in which they played out 'roles' such as artist, engineer, producer, songwriter and mentor. Discussions focused on beliefs and attitudes towards issues such as gun crime and ideological and lyrical thinking. The programme included an activity in which trainees planned their futures upon leaving custody by constructing resettlement packages comprising contacts for follow-up projects or		recovery of historical memory and a focus on the importance of family and connection. Participants showed ownership of the project: taking responsibility for project roles. Creative writing activities in particular fostered dialogue and reflection, reducing inhibitions about discussing feelings and beliefs. They seemed to yearn for a new 'normality' without crime. The creative process allowed participants to explore masculinities that were challenged by custody and also shaped by their experiences of violence on the streets as well as commercialisation representations of 'street life'.	

			educational opportunities.		
Daykin et al. (2017, UK)	To explore how young people in custodial and community supervision settings responded to a music programme. Examined their identification with music, its relevance to their health and wellbeing and its resonance in terms of their lifestyle, behaviour and status. Explored the ways in which their experiences, and the extent to which they appropriated music's affordances, were framed by youth justice environments and social relations.	Mixed methods Participant observation, interviews, focus groups and questionnaires	N=118 young people (N=81 male and N=37 female) aged between 13 and 21 years (mean age of 16.64 years) Music programme led by a national UK arts charity. Fifteen projects were delivered across eight youth justice sites. Each project was facilitated by two or three young professional musicians who typically provided weekly sessions of ninety minutes to three hours for four to ten participants over a six-week period.	Semi-structured interviews and focus groups with the participants, musicians and staff (N=31). Follow-up interviews with five participants three to six months later. Thematic analysis guided by principles of analytic induction, using the constant comparison method, being alert to deviant cases and endeavouring to treat the data comprehensively. The analysis followed two emergent lines of enquiry: 'How do young people respond to the	The youth justice setting: - Musicians needed to introduce a sense of order and focus into what felt like chaotic environments from the outset. - Security issues caused missed sessions or participants leaving early. - Issues in resourcing facilities/rooms. - Staff would influence young people's views and control access to music. Generally supportive but some had negative views and were disruptive as rated music intervention as low priority. Also caused privacy issues which could limit expression.	Affordances, which can be both positive and negative for young people, are strongly mediated by context and social relations that need to be understood in situated research. The findings illustrate the ways in which music-making led by professional musicians can serve as a personal and collective resource for young people in justice settings. Affordances from the intervention include new experiences, broadened horizons, enjoyment, learning, expression, supportive interactions, pride and achievement. The reflexive skills of

			Musicians were drawn from seven groupings, mostly duos and trios, and occasionally the programme included guest solo artists. They were drawn from different backgrounds but were trained to conservatoire level and were skilled at performing, composing and producing music from a wide variety of genres including jazz, folk, world, classical and pop. They were trained to work with vulnerable participants, including prisoners and children.	music-making intervention within the respective justice setting?' and 'What shapes or limits their responses or engagement?' Three researchers undertook iterative and intensive scrutiny of qualitative data, assisted by data analysis software (NVivo-10).	Musicians: - Needed to establish relationships with participants and negotiate with staff and gatekeepers to fit the programme in. - Needed to create a positive and enjoyable process through which to facilitate active learning. - Needed to balance being alert and responsive to the participants' expressed interests and preferences. - Programme delivery was strongly mediated by the qualities, attitudes, skills and reflexive awareness of the musicians leading the sessions. Group dynamics and behaviour:	musicians delivering such programmes are critical.

					- Quite often unruly behaviour causing stress to musicians. - More successful facilitators used a complex array of strategies to manage group dynamics while addressing the needs of the most vulnerable participants. Complexity of music goals: - Participants strongly focused on a goal (professionally recorded CD) which could provide fame. - Recording took a lot of time limiting time for creative groundwork and team-building - Not always possible to involve everyone and there were feelings from participants of anxiety and agitation about the resulting outcome.	

					- Many felt inspired by the experience, some expressed disappointment with the final CD. - Goal setting and matching goals to young people's diverse skills, interests, ambitions and fears is important to a successful experience. Musical affordances: - Changes in attitudes, behaviour, feelings and thoughts, musically expressed by participants - Young people were afforded to work productively together, mitigating the general atmosphere that could be macho and threatening, - The activities seemed to increase young people's confidence as well	

					as their knowledge and skills, in some cases offering real hope for a differently imagined future. Mediating factors meant that programme impacts varied across the participants studied.	
Gowland-Pryde. (2016, UK)	To examine the impact of a Gallery-supported Arts Award programme on young people who have offended.	Semi structured interviews YP and staff. 5 session observations, Artist-Educator reflective journals Associated visual data	Gallery-supported arts awards programme delivered in partnership with the Wessex Youth Offending Team to support young people who have offended. Strand 1: Summer Arts Colleges/Arts Award programme Strand 2: weekly programme scheduled over nine months N=6 YP, N=3 in each of the two strands:	Thematic analysis following Dillon typology structured around the four themes/areas of the typology: Buildings/ Places, People/Bodies, Photograph/Artworks and Objects/Things	Strand 1: YP who participated in the Summer Arts Programme - Enjoyed the photography aspects of the intensive programme - The programme was in contrast to their previous experiences of activities at school - Pts enjoyed meeting and working with new people - Developed positive peer-to-peer interactions	ArtsAward accredited programmes as a type of rite of passage can improve the accessibility of art for young people who have offended; They are effective in supporting young people in desistance from crime; and The use of contemporary art and galleries as part of these programmes can help support young people's re-engagement with

			Strand 1: N=2 male, N=1 female Strand 2: N=2 male, N=1 female. N=10 young people, aged 12-16 years participated in the programme. N=8 male and N=2female. N=5 had experienced custody on one or more occasion, one waiting to start first custodial sentence. N=3 from ethnically diverse backgrounds 9 staff - Artist educators, Youth Offending Service Workers: Strand 1: 2 artist educators, 1 youth offending worker, 1 youth arts co-ordinator		between young people, by allowing them to see people outside of their usual context and through collaborative working on arts project - enjoyable and rewarding experience Strand 2: YP who participated in weekly arts programme - positive impacts due to the programme providing different alternative to the usual activities they were required to engage in as a young offender - gaining new and positive	learning, thereby helping to transform 'young offenders' into 'young artists Embedding programmes within the Youth Offending Service can support offending behaviour work and should be tailored to meet the circumstances of young people who have offended according to their individual needs and the requirements/length of their order

| | | | Strand 2: 3 artist educators, 4 youth offending service | | experiences, and engaging in learning through creativity and being exposed to different kinds of art
- Working within a supportive group, the participants felt safe and comfortable knowing they were not being judged
- YP responded well to personalised learning approach – sense of freedom and choice which enabled the young people to reflection their family relationships, identity and offending behaviour
- Completing the Arts Award programme was a major motivation for all | |

					participants - deterred crime at primary level - The longer-term and consistent nature of this programme, enabled them to develop their relationships among the group and with the wider service	
Hadland & Stickley (2010, UK)	To explore excluded young people's experiences of taking part in a community art project	Qualitative - Descriptive phenomenology with unstructured interviews	N=2 males (aged 15 and 16 years) and N=2 females (aged 14 and 15 years) who had been permanently excluded from school	Unstructured interviews conducted in the local community using a broad opening question ('Tell me about your experience of taking part in the art project") followed by further questions to elicit additional information. Each sentence containing significant	Two main themes were identified: the teenagers' experiences of taking part in the project and their involvement in it. Personal experiences: - Many positive statements in relation to enjoyment and sense of achievement.	This study identified the personal and social benefits of art, including enjoyment, achievement, interacting with peers and engaging with the wider community. These benefits reflect the hopeful nature of artistic expression and the potential that community art projects have in promoting feelings of self-worth

| | | | | statements was recorded on index cards. Statements that were repeated or overlapped were written on the same index cards. Similar cards were grouped together under similar themes, which were then collated into broader themes. This process was repeated until two main themes were identified. | - Two participants had scepticism of the project.
- Project gave them the opportunity to get involved in diverse activities following exclusion from school.
Involvement:
- Two participants felt especially involved with others having the same experience.
- Boys felt girls were more involved.
The project had an inclusive nature and connected them to people in the local community. | and a sense of belonging.
If community art and health projects are to promote inclusion, social capital and reintegration, opportunities for such projects must be developed away from statutory services to engender a sense of social integration.
The findings of the project reveal an interesting relationship between the employees' enthusiasm for community arts projects and the young people's experience of an art project at a grass-roots level. This reflects the uniqueness of individual projects in terms of how they are delivered and the relationships they encompass. |

Hanrahan and Banerjee, 2017 UK	To explore participant experiences of long-term involvement in drama and theatre and consider young people's narratives in relation to the psychological mechanisms identified by our model of disaffection/engagement.	Longitudinal design; in-depth individual interviews. Each participant was interviewed by the first author at three time points over 22 months	Drama and theatre project for young people run by a charitable theatre company with the aim to create a theatre production based on the life experiences of marginalised young people, with parts acted by the young people. 6-month period of weekly or biweekly drama workshops. then 12-week phase of intense rehearsing of a newly scripted version of the production. This work culminated in a 3-week run of the production PTS 4 young people (15–21 years of age; M =	IPA (Smith et al. 2009). The analysis process involved a number of stages which were adapted from Smith, Flowers, and Larkin(2009) and Smith and Osborn (2007) for longitudinal analysis.	**'A nurturing space'** The strong sense of trust, support, encouragement, and belonging was brought between staff and YP, provided the foundations of clear structures and boundaries upon which positive relationships could develop and personal growth occur **'Something for myself'** (1)A positive, constructive activity to fill their time, distraction from anti-social activities. (2) Space for self expression and self exploration & outlet for particularly negative emotions (3) a space for pts to express and 'explore' their authentic	Our results point to the need for an integrated framework that incorporates key psychological processes concerned with social and motivational outcomes, and which draws together core theoretical frameworks concerning self-determination, self-discrepancy, and achievement.

| | | | 18.25, SD = 2.75) who had experienced school exclusion and additional challenging life experiences, such as unstable home environments, poverty, domestic violence, substance misuse, and involvement with the criminal justice system.

Three females; one male. All British with a mixed ethnic profile: two were mixed race, two were Black.

All pts had some amateur experience of taking part in drama and theatre workshops previously | | selves without restriction.

'Changing the story'

The programme, in particular playing a character close to themselves, fostered possibilities of a change in life trajectory. Provided the opportunity and space on reflect on change and highlighted the differences between their past and current self. The perceived differences described by the young people included changes in behaviour and attitude towards others, as well as in their sense of identity | |

Howard, 2022. UK	To capture the experiences of participants accessing the Arts Award programme	Multisite ethnography in five diverse youth settings focusing on marginalised youth. The study covered various arts activities (dance, music, visual arts, and digital media) and included participant observation, one-to-one interviews with participants and staff, and video recording. Settings were further education, alternative education and youth settings. 50 different interviews were undertaken, but some participants had up to five	The Arts Award is an accredited art learning framework for young people who are unlikely to engage in the arts or benefit from existing cultural provision. Young people can gain an award by working with artists and arts professionals in a range of artforms including visual arts to music production, dance and drama. Young people are required to create a portfolio by collecting 'evidence' of their journey and skills development. Attendances varies between being	Grounded theory analysis of themes extracted in order to inform further data collection, hypothesis building and theory testing as the study progressed. The analytical approach of this study was to start with the small, in-depth personal experiences of a small group of participants and then to work outwards to consider the wider impacts and implications for at-risk youth through often unintended exclusionary outcomes of the programme.	Young people seemed disengaged and disconnected, describing low level tasks and a lack of choice during the programme. The quality of the programme was limited: critical and contemporary arts experiences were not introduced or were devoid of cultural scaffolding; stereotyping of 'at-risk' youth as non-academic and non-artistic frequently led to the design of remedial programmes, in which the arts are considered as secondary outcomes. The programme demonstrated a deficit orientation and a didactic, mechanistic	Although the programme offered valuable opportunities for marginalised young people to engage with the arts, they offer weak artistic content and limited opportunities for personal development for 'at risk' young people who are likely to receive poorer quality, deficit-oriented, mechanistic and instrumentalised arts experiences. Opportunities for creative exploration, growth and connection are limited. The authors argue that a key failure has been the lack of acknowledgement on

		interviews. 432 hours were spent undertaking fieldwork. Participants were also shadowed at community arts and performance events. Data include photos, artwork, drawings, music tracks, radio production and social media.	compulsory and open access. This study includes 46 participants aged between 14 and 23 in three alternative education and two youth programmes based in the East Midlands of England. Participants were categorised as 'at-risk' by reasons of school exclusion, behaviour, disability family and home environment.		and instrumentalised approach, hence low expectations were set, and teaching was heavy on direction, controlling behaviour and compliance.	how youth arts programs, which are practised differently in different settings, can exacerbate educational and social divides.
Morgan et.al. (2020, UK)	To understand the processes through which a community based intervention for marginalised young people might support social inclusion and social mobility.	Qualitative observations semi-structured, interviews with participants (N=12), stakeholders/partners (N=3), and the project lead. A focus group was undertaken with the project team (N=6).	Future Stars is a charitable organisation catering for young people aged 11–25 years, many of whom were within the care system or involved (or termed 'at-risk' of involvement) in youth and/or violent gang-related crime.	Grounded theory: open, axial and selective coding and four stage analysis process to draw out generic themes.	Two themes are explored (i) recognition and acceptance as a foundation for social inclusion, and (ii) accumulating (social) capital and acquiring employment. Study participants faced barriers of social exclusion, resulting in feelings of	Informal rather than formal structures of recognition addressed young people's low sense of self-worth, allowing relationships of acceptance and trust to develop through everyday interactions, thus enabling positive outcomes. 'Our findings demonstrate that

			Participants choose between a variety of variety of sports, media and arts activities designed to progress them into employment, education and/or training. Future Stars works with corporate/business partners and statutory agencies and utilises the expertise of highly skilled and well-respected individuals from across the sports, arts, entertainments, education and youth and community sectors. Arts interventions are not described in detail. Participants (n=12) were representative of a related survey of 74 participants who		worthlessness and low confidence reinforced by low expectations of others. The project helped to address these barriers by fostering strong interpersonal relationships, through which young people could be recognised for the qualities they brought to the project. *Informal* rather than formal *structures of recognition* allowed a sense of acceptance and trust to develop. Young people commented on the ability of staff to make them feel welcome, at ease and understood, rather than judged, which often sat in stark contrast to their experiences of previous relationships with adults, including schooling. They spoke of feeling welcome and	upper-most within these conditions is the necessity for marginalised young people to generate trusting relationships with key personnel associated with the intervention concerned.' It is through these processes that such projects may operate as catalysts for personal and social change.

			aged 13-25. Just over half of survey participants described themselves as White males, and almost a third were living with their parent/s. Just over a third said they had been in trouble with the police and a small number had spent time in custody.		relaxed, enjoying friendly and informal interactions, laughing and joking, and feeling surprised that people recognised their talents, showed interested in them and were willing to put time and effort into helping them. As a result, numerous participants spoke of increased self-confidence and self-esteem and a growing sense of achievement arising from successfully negotiating a task or situation. They spoke positively about help they received in relation to their engagement in meaningful activities such as education, training and employment. This reorientation process relied on the efforts of staff to offer meaningful	

| | | | | and non-judgemental guidance and by providing dedicated and tailored (long-term) support to participants. Project staff emphasized the importance of spending quality time with young people. Relationships of trust seemed to allow young to understand their interests, expectations and ambitions, the barriers they were facing, and where they were at in their employment journey.

Informal structures of recognition and acceptance-based relationships may have provide the foundation upon which an enhanced sense of social inclusion could be constructed. The project provided access to | |

					practical employment support and development opportunities. No arts related processes are cited although one participant spoke of gaining work experience at a local television company. Many young people held an interest in entering careers within sport, media and art. Interactions between project staff and the corporate project partners helped to break down negative views of marginalised young people.	
Parker et. al (2018, UK)	To qualitatively explore the potential benefits of a school-based mentoring intervention for pupils engaged in, or at risk of, delinquency both within and outside of the school environment	Qualitative Interviews of 15 - 30 min and were audio recorded and transcribed in full.	10-week music-based program supported by tutors and provided by mental health charity. Sessions involved lyric writing, composing beats,	Thematic and axial coding were used to analyze the data in four stages.	Potential mechanisms and processes are themed as follows: **Music-making and personal identity.** The project afforded	Music-making can be used to engage marginalised youth in educational settings, and mentoring can establish trusting relationships with those who typically reject

| | | | recording, and/or performing music

Participants:

32 pupils (28 male and 4 female) aged between 13 and 16 years participated in the intervention, some of whom were considered "at risk." | | participants opportunities to share their music-related work, to gain experience in talking to people, to express themselves,including negative feelings and frustration, and to receive positive feedback and praise from others (e.g. compliments, applause, witnessing others enjoying their music).

Young people reported that as a result of taking part in the intervention and writing lyrics with tutors their perceptions of rap had changed, as had their style of writing. Over the duration of the intervention, lyrics became less violent and anti-social. | conventional authority structures

Music-based interventions in such settings may have psychological, behavioural, and social benefits for the participants, such as increased confidence, improved attitudes towards schooling and the future, improved behaviours, better communication skills, and decreased externalizing behaviours. These intermediate outcomes have been linked with desistance from delinquency can positively impact the individual lives of participants and their wider environment. |

| | | | | | Music-making and behavioural change

The use of music afforded a sense of escapism and relaxation, participants seemed strongly motivated to attend.

Music-making and mentoring

Pupils reported that, in contrast with teachers, music tutors listened to and showed an interest in them. This appeared to allow pupils to feel valued and respected in an environment where much of their previous interaction had been dominated by conflict, lowering their resistance. The mentoring role of tutors also appeared to provide | |

					students with the opportunity to reflect upon their feelings and express their emotions, as has been identified within other mentoring programmes. The capacity of tutors to offer one-to-one support enabled pupils to complete tasks more readily, thus facilitating a sense of achievement via positive reinforcement.	
Tett et al (2012, Scotland UK)	To stimulate prisoners' engagement with learning; improve participants' literacy, numeracy and communication and demonstrate the potential of the arts to support the process of rehabilitation.	Qualitative Focus Groups (before and after intervention)	Intervention CASE 1: Scottish Opera and the Scottish Chamber Orchestra, and the Citizens Theatre. The Scottish Ensemble's Music for Change project initially involved 25 young men who worked alongside the Scottish Ensemble's Artist in Residence and the music tutor at the	Thematic Analysis	1) Changing negative attitudes to learning by creating culture of skills development 2) Building an active learning culture as part of the process 3) Enabling people to work collaboratively and responsibly 4) Increasing confidence and self-esteem	'Inspiring Change' It has shown the value of using the arts in prison to develop learning and may provide a way of challenging the focus on skills for employability by demonstrating the value of this approach in encouraging productive learning that leads to lasting change.

			Young Offenders Institute in learning how to play and record music over four months. 15 prisoners (young offender's institution) performed with members of the Scottish Ensemble and a second performance with the entire Scottish Ensemble.			
Varley (2019, UK)	To explore how the arts, in particular drama (V2 model), can positively contribute to the process of reducing reoffending behaviour and reoffending rates with male young offenders serving community sentences.	Qualitative semi-structured interviews were undertaken with a sample of 10 offenders, asking them for their views on the V2 intervention programme at the three months follow-up stage.	Drama Intervention based on RECRE8. The Recre8 interventions address previous antisocial behaviour; antisocial cognition through the use of a central character(s); influence of peers; positive relationships; encouraging educational performance and leisure activities by	Thematic Analysis	Mechanisms of success 1 - Programme Distinctiveness (relatable content, safe for learning, dram techniques central) 2 - Going above and beyond (facilitators, peer mentors, familial structure in groups Change (maturity, personal skills/development, cognitive	This thesis bridges the research gap in the areas of rehabilitating young male offenders, by utilising a mixed methods approach, highlighting the benefits of drama interventions, and in particular with low and medium risk offenders, producing a scientific

				development/hope for future)	framework to measure the impact of behavioural change with in a creative intervention. This research thesis contributes towards the literature around the arts and rehabilitation models for young male offenders.
			encouraging and enhance involvement and encourage participation through drama techniques, with an aim to reduce the risk of reoffending. For the interviews n=10 post interventions male young offenders aged 10-18 years of age (mean age 15 years, SD = 1.66), referred by Birmingham Youth Offending Service over a period of 18 months, to the Recre8 company, which used the V2 method of drama-based intervention.			
Zlotowitz et al (2016, UK)	To explore the development of Music & Change, an innovative and comprehensive intervention accessible to young people, which aimed to	Qualitative Ethnography (field notes)	Coproduction of 'Music and Change' led by young people, it became centred on using contemporary	Thematic Analysis to focus on perceptions of delivery.	Core principles of the intervention

Trusted relationships (long-term and | Music & Change was valued by young people who do not easily engage with professionals and |

holistically meet the mental health and other needs of its participants and ultimately to reduce offending rates.		music skills (e.g. DJ-ing and lyric writing) as a vehicle for building relationships and over time helping the young people in ways they requested, including supporting their mental health. In an inner-city, high-density housing estate in the United Kingdom, with approximately 500 apartments. 60% of residents were white and 40% from black and ethnic minority groups. Area fell within the 14% most deprived similar-sized areas in England. 25 young people over 2 years. Intervention focused on a core group of 15 young people who were informally identified as the most in need.		consistent, non-judgemental) Responsive, flexible, relevant Local and safe Peer and youth -led Holistic (supporting mental health, job seeking, stability) Creating contextual change (beyond the individual)	services. The findings led to the development of the 'Integrate' model, which is using these coproduced principles to underpin several new pilot projects that aim to address the health and social inequalities of excluded young people Programme characteristics underline positive experiences of participants, fostering development of trusting relationships and overcoming barriers to help-seeking behaviours.

			Of the core group, the majority were male (n = 13), two females. Most were of white British ethnicity, with a minority of Eastern European origin, Asian or black British. This pattern of ethnicity approximated that of the local community. Median participant age was 19; range 16–22. Exact demographic data were not known for all young people because they reported that such data collection was a barrier to attendance			